

DRAFT

COASTAL REGIONAL SEDIMENT MANAGEMENT PLAN FOR SOUTHERN MONTEREY BAY

Prepared for

Association of Monterey Bay Area Governments

Prepared by

Philip Williams & Associates, Ltd.

with

Ed Thornton
Jenifer Dugan
Halcrow Group
Gary Griggs

June 2008

PWA REF. 1902.00

Services provided pursuant to this Agreement are intended solely for the use and benefit of the Association of Monterey Bay Area Governments.

No other person or entity shall be entitled to rely on the services, opinions, recommendations, plans or specifications provided pursuant to this agreement without the express written consent of Philip Williams & Associates, Ltd., 550 Kearny Street, Suite 900, San Francisco, CA 94108.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page No.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY	1
RECOMMENDED POLICY CHANGES	2
RECOMMENDED MANAGEMENT CHANGES	2
RECOMMENDED PROJECTS FOR FEASIBILITY ANALYSIS	3
SUMMARY OF SCIENTIFIC FINDINGS	4
1. INTRODUCTION	1
1.1 REGIONAL SEDIMENT MANAGEMENT	1
1.1.1 Southern Monterey Bay Coastal Regional Sediment Management Plan	1
1.2 GEOMORPHOLOGY	3
1.3 INFRASTRUCTURE	8
1.3.1 Coastal Armoring and Development	8
1.3.2 Utilities	10
1.3.3 Highway 1	11
1.4 PHYSICAL PROCESSES	11
1.4.1 Tidal Regime	11
1.4.2 Wave Climate	12
1.4.3 Base Flood Elevations	14
1.4.4 Relative Sea-Level Rise	15
2. SEDIMENT BUDGET	16
2.1 DEFINITION OF SOUTHERN MONTEREY BAY LITTORAL CELL	16
2.2 SEDIMENT TRANSPORT	18
2.3 SEDIMENT SUPPLY	21
2.3.1 Salinas River	21
2.3.2 Potential Barriers to River Sediment Transport	24
2.3.3 Dune and Beach Erosion South of the Salinas River	25
2.4 FUTURE EROSION RATES IN RESPONSE TO SEA-LEVEL RISE	29
2.5 SEDIMENT SINKS	30
2.5.1 Dune and Beach Accretion North of the Salinas River	31
2.5.2 Monterey Submarine Canyon	31
2.5.3 Historic Sand Mining at Marina and Sand City Using Drag Lines	31
2.5.4 Ongoing Hydraulic Sand Mining at Marina	34
2.5.5 Offshore	35
2.6 SAND BUDGET	35
2.6.1 Sand Inputs and Outputs	35
2.6.2 Sand Deficits Analysis	37

2.7	BEACH AND SHOREFACE SEDIMENT PARTICLE SIZE	38
2.7.1	Beach Sand	38
2.7.2	Shoreface Sand	41
3.	CRITICAL AREAS OF EROSION	42
3.1	RISK AND CONSEQUENCES OF EROSION	42
3.2	SITE SHORT-LIST	43
3.3	HIGH TO MODERATE RISK AND HIGH CONSEQUENCE AREAS	45
3.3.1	Sanctuary Beach Resort near Reservation Road	45
3.3.2	Sand City and Tioga Avenue West of Highway 1	46
3.3.3	Seaside Pump Station at Bay Avenue	48
3.3.4	Monterey Interceptor between Seaside Pump Station and Wharf II	50
3.3.5	Monterey Beach Resort, Highway 1 and Resort Access Road	51
3.3.6	Ocean Harbor House Condominiums/Del Monte Beach Subdivision	52
3.3.7	Monterey La Playa Town Homes at La Playa Street	54
3.4	LOW RISK AND/OR LOW CONSEQUENCE AREAS	55
3.5	CRITICAL AREAS OF EROSION SHORT-LIST	56
4.	CRITICAL SPECIES AND HABITAT	58
4.1	SENSITIVE HABITAT	58
4.1.1	Rocky Reef	58
4.1.2	Kelp Forest	59
4.1.3	Eelgrass Meadow	60
4.1.4	Sandy Beaches	61
4.1.5	Sandy Subtidal	62
4.1.6	Coastal Dunes	62
4.2	NATIVE ANIMALS	63
4.2.1	Western Snowy Plover	63
4.2.2	Shorebirds	64
4.2.3	Black Legless Lizard	65
4.2.4	Smith's Blue Butterfly	65
4.2.5	Globose Dune Beetle	65
4.2.6	Southern Sea Otter	66
4.2.7	California Grunion	66
4.2.8	Pismo Clam	66
4.2.9	Beach Invertebrates	67
4.3	NATIVE PLANTS	67
5.	REGIONAL SEDIMENT MANAGEMENT APPROACHES	69
5.1	BEACH NOURISHMENT	71
5.1.1	Potential Environmental Impacts of Beach Nourishment	72
5.1.2	Mitigation Measures	75
5.1.3	Potential Receiver Site in the Southern Bight	76

5.2	ELIMINATE FACTORS THAT EXACERBATE EROSION	76
5.2.1	Impacts of Sand Mining at Sand City	77
5.2.2	Impacts of Sand Mining at Marina	77
5.2.3	Beneficial Impacts of Sand Mine Closure	78
5.2.4	Potential Strategy for Stopping Mining	79
5.3	ALLOW DUNE EROSION TO CONTINUE	83
5.4	OTHER POTENTIAL EROSION RESPONSE ALTERNATIVES	83
5.4.1	Hard Structural Approaches	83
5.4.2	Dewatering	85
5.4.3	Retention	85
5.4.4	Bluff Top Development Set Back	85
6.	POTENTIAL SEDIMENT SOURCES	87
6.1	HARBORS AND WETLANDS	89
6.1.1	Moss Landing Harbor Entrance Channel	90
6.1.2	Monterey Harbor	91
6.2	FLOOD CONTROL PROJECTS	92
6.2.1	Sediment Impounded by Dams	92
6.2.2	Salinas River Sand Bar Breaching	93
6.3	INLAND COMMERCIAL SITES	93
6.3.1	Stockpiling	93
6.4	DUNES AT FORD ORD	94
6.5	OFFSHORE LOCATIONS	95
6.5.1	Monterey Submarine Canyon	95
6.5.2	Zone of Sand Offshore from Sand City	96
6.5.3	Nearshore Relict Sand Corridor	98
6.6	SEDIMENT SOURCE SHORT-LIST	99
6.7	ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS AT POTENTIAL SOURCE AREAS	99
6.7.1	Mitigation Measures	100
7.	ECONOMIC FEASIBILITY OF BEACH NOURISHMENT	101
7.1	POTENTIAL BEACH NOURISHMENT ALTERNATIVES	101
7.2	APPROACH TO ECONOMIC ANALYSIS	103
7.2.1	Application of the Coastal Sediment Benefits Analysis Tool	103
7.2.2	Estimation of Protection Benefits	105
7.3	COSTS AND BENEFITS	106
7.3.1	Costs	106
7.3.2	Recreational Benefits	108
7.3.3	Property Protection Benefits	112
7.3.4	Ecologic Protection Benefits	114
7.4	ECONOMIC VIABILITY OF ALTERNATIVES	114
7.4.1	Alternative 1: Small-Scale Nourishment of the Southern Bight	114
7.4.2	Alternative 2: Large-Scale Nourishment of the Southern Bight	115

8.	REGULATORY PROCESSES	117
8.1	REGULATORY COMPLIANCE PROCESS	117
8.1.1	SCOUP Permitting Process	118
8.2	FEDERAL REGULATIONS	118
8.2.1	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary	119
8.3	STATE REGULATIONS	121
8.3.1	California Coastal Commission and Local Coastal Programs	122
8.3.2	California Department of Parks and Recreation	127
9.	POTENTIAL FUNDING SOURCES	128
9.1	FEDERAL FUNDING SOURCES	128
9.1.1	U.S. Army Corps of Engineers	128
9.1.2	U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service	130
9.1.3	Monterey Bay National Marine Sanctuary	130
9.2	STATE FUNDING SOURCES	130
9.2.1	California Department of Boating and Waterways	130
9.2.2	California Coastal Conservancy	131
9.2.3	California Coastal Commission	131
9.3	LOCAL/REGIONAL MATCHING FUNDS	132
9.3.1	Transient Occupancy Tax	132
9.3.2	Real Estate Transfer Tax	132
9.3.3	Tax Levied on Sporting Goods	133
9.3.4	User Fees	133
9.3.5	Cost-Sharing Among Project Beneficiaries	133
9.3.6	Special Assessments	133
10.	GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE	134
10.1	AMBAG AND JOINT POWERS AUTHORITY	134
10.1.1	San Diego Association of Governments	134
10.1.2	Beach Erosion Authority for Clean Oceans and Nourishment	135
10.1.3	Joint Powers Authority Options	135
10.2	RECOMMENDED GOVERNANCE STRUCTURE	135
10.2.1	Partners	137
10.2.2	Implementation	137
10.2.3	Outreach and Dissemination	138
11.	DATA GAPS	139
11.1	SEDIMENT BUDGET	139
11.2	SENSITIVE SPECIES AND HABITAT	139
12.	REFERENCES	141

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1. NOAA Tidal Datums for Monterey Harbor (Station ID: 9413450)	12
Table 2. FEMA (2007) Base Flood Elevations (BFE)	14
Table 3. Estimated Historic Long-term Average Erosion Rates (ft/year)	26
Table 4. Decadal Sand Mined at Sand City and Marina (yd ³ /year x 1000)	33
Table 5. Sand Budget Salinas River to Moss Landing (x1000 yd ³ /year)	36
Table 6. Sand Budget Wharf II to Salinas River mouth (x1000 yd ³ /year)	36
Table 7. Sand Budget Wharf II to Sand City (x1000 yd ³ /year)	37
Table 8. Mean Particle Size of Beach Sand in Southern Three Miles	39
Table 9. Mean Particle Size of Beach Sand North of Sand City	40
Table 10. Critical Areas of Erosion	44
Table 11. Bird Counts in Monterey Bay (Neuman et al., 2008)	64
Table 12. Potential Erosion Response Alternatives (SMBCEW, 2006a)	70
Table 13. Particle Size of Sand Offshore from Sand City (Reid et al., 2006)	97
Table 14. Potential Beach Nourishment Alternatives for Southern Monterey Bay	102
Table 15. Annual Visitor Numbers for Monterey State Beach	105
Table 16. Small-Scale Nourishment of the Southern Bight sourced from Monterey Harbor (Alternative 1)	107
Table 17. Large-Scale Nourishment of the Southern Bight (Alternative 2)	107
Table 18. Recreational Benefits of Small-Scale Nourishment of the Southern Bight with Beach Placement (Alternative 1a)	109
Table 19. Recreational Benefits of Small-Scale Nourishment of the Southern Bight with Nearshore Placement (Alternative 1b)	110
Table 20. Recreational Benefits of Large-Scale Nourishment of the Southern Bight with Beach Placement (Alternatives 2a and 2c)	111
Table 21. Recreational Benefits of Large-Scale Nourishment of the Southern Bight with Nearshore Placement (Alternatives 2b and 2d)	112
Table 22. Assets Protected by Beach Nourishment	113
Table 23. Economic Summary of Alternative 1	114
Table 24. Economic Summary of Alternative 2	115
Table 25. Relevant Federal Regulations Affecting Beach Restoration Projects	119
Table 26. Relevant State Regulations Affecting Beach Restoration Projects	121

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Location Map	5
Figure 2. Locations at the Southern End of Southern Monterey Bay	6
Figure 3. Eroding Dune Bluffs at Fort Ord	7
Figure 4. Bathymetry of Southern Monterey Bay	8
Figure 5. Armoring at Monterey Beach Resort and Ocean Harbor House Condominiums	9

Figure 6. Coastal Structures at Sand City	10
Figure 7. Monterey Regional Water Pollution Control Agency Facilities and Highway 1	11
Figure 8. Significant Wave Heights in Monterey Bay	13
Figure 9. Historical Monthly Averaged MSL at San Francisco Relative to Station Datum	15
Figure 10. Southern Monterey Bay Littoral Sub-Cells and Transport Directions	17
Figure 11. Calculated Sediment Transport (green) and Net Transport of Rip Channel Morphology (blue)	19
Figure 12. Distribution of Surface Medium and Coarse Sand South of the Salinas River	20
Figure 13. Salinas River during a Flood and Bar Breach	22
Figure 14. Dune Erosion Rates in Southern Monterey Bay	27
Figure 15. Rip Currents and Erosion ‘Hot Spots’	29
Figure 16. Location of Sand Mines	32
Figure 17. Aerial Photographs of Marina Sand Mine	34
Figure 18. Mean Particle Size of Beach Sand	39
Figure 19. Location of Critical Areas of Erosion	43
Figure 20. Sanctuary Beach Resort	45
Figure 21. Storage Facility at the end of Tioga Avenue	47
Figure 22. Seaside Pump Station	49
Figure 23. Monterey Beach Resort	51
Figure 24. Ocean Harbor House Condominiums	53
Figure 25. Monterey La Playa Town Homes	55
Figure 26. Location of Del Monte Shale Beds	59
Figure 27. Location of the Kelp Forest and Eelgrass Meadow	60
Figure 28. Location of the Eelgrass Meadow	61
Figure 29. Sensitive Habitat, Critical Areas of Erosion, and Proposed Receiver Site	73
Figure 30. Conceptual Model of Sand Mining Impacts on Sediment Transport	77
Figure 31. Stilwell Hall Armoring Before and After Removal	84
Figure 32. Location of Potential Sediment Sources	89
Figure 33. Moss Landing Harbor Dredge Disposal Sites	91
Figure 34. Offshore Sediment Types	98
Figure 35. Recommended AMBAG Governance Structure	136